
LONDON – AFRALO General Assembly
Wednesday, June 25, 2014 – 15:00 to 17:00
ICANN – London, England

AZIZ HILALI: My name is Aziz Hiali. I am the chair of AFRALO. We have interpretation in French and English. I will speak in French. Please, take your headphones, and all the meeting we can use English or French. Thank you.

We are not as many as we hope because five or six members of AFRALO ALS representatives couldn't come in London because they had visa problems. Also, Fatimata, the former chair of AFRALO, couldn't come. She's going to participate with us.

But first before giving the floor to Pierre Dandjinou, I want to ask you if you have something to add into our agenda. We had to have a two-hour meeting, but we have a time issue so we have to leave the room at 4:30.

If you have nothing to add, we are going to give the floor to Pierre Dandjinou, the vice president of ICANN for the African region. He's going to speak to us. It's not the first time in this week, but as it is a meeting for the African region, we thank him and we give him the floor. Pierre, you have the floor.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. Good afternoon to you all. Yeah, I believe that by this time, most of you have certainly heard from me as far as the African strategy is concerned but definitely the implementation status so far.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

Maybe what I will try to do within the next ten minutes or so is to also highlight maybe what you could be doing to have the Internet users' voice heard at some point.

Because yesterday, I did have a kind of feedback after our session here that, well, why are you guys talking so much on industry, on business? Tell me, why are you putting so much stress on Africa becoming an industry and you are not really talking about what the user at large should be benefitting from all of this?

I thought that we should just put those things into perspective. Nobody is saying that it's just about developing an African market. I think we just need to bear in mind that the Africa strategy ultimately – I will say it has two focuses, actually.

Yes, it's about making sure that the DNS business picks up in Africa, definitely. It's about business. It's about industry. I personally believe in that.

But secondly – or the second pillar is the participation. Never forget that the strategy came up also partly because African minister in charge of ICT one day met at the ICANN 47 or whatever – 46 – in Dakar. They had a declaration in Dakar.

In that declaration, one of the things they requested from ICANN was to make sure that there was better participation, more participation of Africa within ICANN and also a better presence of ICANN in Africa. That was what their request is for. The strategy definitely is also about increasing African participation, definitely.

Now, the projects we do have so far, of course, are only those projects that we thought that might have some impact. Never forget that the strategy is for three years' time, and never forget that it's just a support from ICANN.

I also remember when we were actually designing this strategy, some of the questions, some of the suggestions we were having was, "Okay, this is about ICANN strategy for Africa. Where is Africa's strategy itself for ICANN?" I don't know where. You got me there.

What I'm trying to say is, okay, we do have a strategy. It's for three years. But how do we make this thing sustainable? How do you work maybe after three years to really amplify what you have achieved? Because that, for me is also an important thing.

That's why having the business or industry portion is important here. It would be interesting to have, apart from what I keep on saying sponsoring or sponsorship from ICANN or ISOC or whatever, that we also have sponsorship from African institutions.

Because some of the operators we do have today definitely can do those things, but maybe just because they are not exposed to the realities or to the issues that we are talking about. I think that we do need to have some sort of homework to be done to engage with these communities.

I'm not going – because the website is there, you will see some of the projects we are doing. Some of you rightly point out, "Okay, these are projects you guys are doing, but at the end of it" – and I think it was

[Ben] who put that question to me. “At the end of all of this, are we going to have something really harmonized?”

He’s right on that. If we are implementing eight to ten projects this year and next year ten projects, in the long run how are we measuring whatever success we are having, whatever impact we are having? These are quite important questions, [Ben], and I think that’s why we feel that it is high time that we start what we are calling – we need a steering committee to actually oversee implementation of this. It’s important.

We do have an Africa Strategy Working Group. Our plan is to have more ideas on which are the criteria that you guys would like to set up so that we do implement this or have this steering committee that oversee what we do.

But also one of the responsibilities will be to help you mobilize new additional funding because I keep on saying it’s not just about support we are having from ICANN that will make those things really sustainable. I don’t believe it.

If you really think about it, we are talking about 54 African countries. There are so many issues there to be dealt with. What you can just do is have a few priorities, and that’s what we did so far.

Your theme here is about the user’s voice, actually. I believe that one of the ways of you really make sure that user’s voice is heard is to expose the user, actually, to the realities. I’m seeing work to be done by, say for instance, the regulators in countries. A regulator normally should be making sure that the consumer also is part of the agenda. It is not

happening in most places. Our [inaudible] [has to be pushing in toward this thing.]

As far as we are concerned, we thought that maybe we need to be in some sort of strategic partnership locally so that some of the projects that we have could be done either with universities or research centers, but also with local private sector. These are some of the things we are really thinking about right now.

Lastly in terms of participation, of course, you certainly heard that the CEO was talking about doubling fellowships. That's fine. That's about increasing the number of people that attend.

I believe that – and, Mr. Chair, I would like to stop there – I believe that we can do more than participation. We need to have, of course, more engagement, more people doing this. They are volunteers, and then they are ready to take responsibilities within ICANN, within the supporting organization. That is important for me. That's what I'm calling effective participation to ICANN meeting, and this is part of our agenda.

Later on, they will have the session here, and there was a question about our key strategy indicators that we are having, because at some point we will have to evaluate what we are doing. That's why we would like to set up this steering committee, and we'll be clear about the indicator that we are going to have to measure whatever success we are making. It's going to be an ongoing exercise of monitoring the whole thing.

These are a few ideas I thought I would just put forward. If you have any question, we can just discuss this later. Thank you for your attention.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Pierre. Thank you for the respect for the time that was allocated to you. I think that as everybody's here, it should be good for all the ALS representatives to present themselves because it's only the second time we meet with them. We can begin with Zahra.

ZAHRA MOHAMED: Good afternoon, all of you. I'm Zahra from ISOC Somalia Chapter. Thank you.

CHIMA ONYEKWERE: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Chima Onyekwere. I sit on the board of NiRA. NiRA is the Nigerian Internet Registration Association. I also work for DigitalSENSE Africa media. Thank you very much.

DIDIER KASOLE: Didier Kasole, ISOC Congo.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Yaovi Atohoun, one of the staff members in Africa.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible]. I work with [inaudible] Africa, from Nigeria.

[NATE]: Hello, everyone. My name is [Nate] [inaudible], ISOC UK. Thank you.

OLIVIER [INAUDIBLE]: Hi. I am Olivier [inaudible] from [inaudible] Cameroon.

BEN FULLER: Hi. I'm Ben Fuller. I'm from .na.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Pastor Peters Omoragbon from Nurses Across the Borders, Nigeria.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich, ICANN staff.

GISELLA GRUBER: Gisella Gruber, ICANN staff.

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang, ICANN staff.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Tijani Ben Jemaa, [inaudible] Tunisie.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Mohamed El Bashir, ISOC Sudan.

PHILIP JOHNSON: Philip Johnson, ISOC Liberia.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

MWENDWA KIVUVA: Mwendwa Kivuva, Internet Society, Kenya.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible], Tunisian Association for CIT.

ALAN LEVIN: Alan Levin, ISOC .za, South Africa.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] Federation of Consumers.

BERAN GILLEN: Beran Gillen, ALAC.

MERCY MOYO: Mercy Moyo, ITOCA, South Africa.

[LEE AMADOU]: [Lee Amadou], member of the telecommunication and regulation entity from Senegal.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. If there are no questions to Pierre, we can move to the second item. That is to say the presentation of the activity report from Dakar to London. I'm going to begin with this activity report. [Higher], please. Okay, Beran then Alan.

BERAN GILLEN: Thank you, Aziz. I just wanted to ask Pierre when will this steering committee be put together, and who will decide who will be on the steering committee?

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, we are going to give the floor to Alan too. Then we will give the answer.

ALAN LEVIN: I just wanted to ask Pierre a question for clarity, if I may, regarding the point he mentioned about implementation of the Africa strategy at the local level. Are there any specific suggestions or recommendations or details that you can give us regarding how you believe we as ALSes could be assisting in this strategy rollout?

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you very much, Beran, for your question. Well, the steering committee, okay, our plans should be formed in FY15, which is starting from 1 July. So probably by September/October we would like to have this in place.

Now, to your question: who really set up organizing the committee? We would like to rely on the community for [inaudible] the criteria. Yesterday, one of the ideas was to see what to see what could be the criteria.

You remember when we formed the working group, what we did was have people from different supporting organizations, people that are already conversant with ICANN. Of course, it seemed to me that most people didn't understand this. You remember, there was heated debates on African list on why this was there.

That's why we really want to open up this steering committee to discussion. But of course, we are going to wait for three months or four months. At some point, we will have to work on a few criteria, and then we will select the people.

But I have to be clear about that one. I'm not going to stop on debating [inaudible] on those things. It's a small number of people. It might be 7; it might be 12. I don't know. All of this is going to be discussed by the community.

We don't want to be in a position where if a country would like to have someone up there, no. The working group was about nine people, you see. But we always get into those details. It took us ten years to organize AFRINIC because we could not know exactly – we could not stick to the substance of it. Everyone wanted to be part of it, but when it comes to working you are only having two people. So I think we need to understand those issues. We are going to be firm on that. Sorry about this.

Yes, please? No. Oh, sorry, Chair. You are the one.

AZIZ HILALI:

Alan? [inaudible] Yes?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Yeah, thanks once again, Pierre, for the insight you give on the African strategy. But I also think, especially now that your office is thinking of getting a steering committee on the strategy, we must as Africans begin to think in ways just like you mentioned.

There's one thing I feel also that must be very paramount to that as a success. We should not leave out core or specialized African media practitioners when we are doing this kind of thing, especially if we want a buy-in of investors within the African regions.

Because if this set of group of persons are not enshrined or [enmeshed] within the subject matter for people to stop projecting it from each region of Africa. You just need now – we have 54 countries within Africa – only you cannot do the job. Agreed.

But then we must realize the importance of other people also playing certain roles, and for us to move it forward from there. If it means us creating a kind of [inaudible] for people from various regions that we can trust, just a selected few to be part of ICANN engagement, it will help us in dipping in their knowledge and for them to also project this revolution to our [At-Large] African community, especially the investors, and present the environment in a way that you would be attractive to people to come.

If you look at what is happening in Nigeria, for instance, [MTA and others] who came there did not come there because the environment was too good for them at the time. They came. They took the risk. But today, everybody's singing a good song about the revolution that came along with their investment.

We must key into some of these things. We must also realize that we have to educate them. If you don't educate this set of practitioners, for instance, trained media practitioners who know how to sift [inaudible] stories from [inaudible], we may be missing the track, actually. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

I'd like [inaudible] take the floor. I'd like you to be brief. Okay, another question, and then we move to the next item.

[ALAN LEVIN]:

[inaudible] and the answer was not to the question. It was another point. So thank you. That's the right answer. The answer is coming.

So if I may make a suggestion to that steering committee, one of the things that came out in our particular Thematic Group was that we would like to be involved as ALSes, and not only involved but empowered to do ICANN outreach which we identify as part of our role as ALSes.

If there's a way that ICANN can include our contact information on their website as the ALS outreaching to end users, I know that certainly ISOC

South Africa would be very happy to field telephone calls, any other type of questions regarding ICANN outreach.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Alan. Pierre?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Sorry. I was actually responding to Beran’s question about the committee. That’s all. But as far as your question was concerned, especially how we are engaging with the local committee and working on the local level, of course we definitely need to and we are already working with – now, what are the specifics to that? Maybe that could be your question. For instance, we’re already working with ISOC Africa.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Sorry. Sorry. Let me finish, please. We are working with ISOC Africa because we are amplifying some of the outreach activity we are doing in Africa – ccTLD [new studies]. But of course, there are a few principles, and I like what you are saying. If it’s about ICANN having links to your ALS, why not? That’s a good thing to do.

I also know that we need to rely on kind of focal points per country so that where we go – because for Yaovi and [Bob], for instance, when they go to countries they do have at least people that really work with them and that who also continue with the engagement strategy they

are trying to develop in specific countries. Yes, definitely, I think they will have to liaise with you guys now.

If the plan or the suggestion is for this to be formally inscribed somewhere, that's another issue. But for me, this [inaudible] signaling this aspect-wise which actually we haven't forgotten about. But we just note your points, and we'll act upon it. That's what I could tell.

AZIZ HILALI:

Okay, please when you take the floor, please tell your name. Okay.

MWENDWA KIVUVA:

I wanted to support Pierre's point that we should take the challenge to probably get into the DNS business. As ALS, we have the opportunity to educate the business community within our regions on how they can get into the DNS business and how it benefits them.

For example, when we had the new gTLD programs, there was very low participation from the African region. I don't believe it was because of money. It was just that the business community did not see the need why they should get into it.

If in our local initiatives the ideas or any outreach we do if we involve the business community and show them that there is an opportunity in the business, it means that like, for example, in the next round of new gTLDs the business will see that there is need.

Because there are very big businesses in Africa. There are very big companies. Like the telecom companies in Africa are very big, and they cannot really participate in this business. But us, we can not only

advocate for the rights of users if we are advocating for their rights but they cannot get the service.

We also have to show we can only benefit the users if we involve the businesses to bring the products to the users. Because you can advocate for the rights of the users every day, but the services that the users will consume are not there. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much. We are going to move to the next item. That is the activity report. The last general assembly of AFRALO was in Dakar. We had a meeting with 20 ALSes.

As you know, AFRALO is the organization which represents the community of Internet users in the African region into ICANN. It is a community. It is a community working for an Internet more secure and open to everybody. Its objective is to inform and promote the participation of Internet users in ICANN policy, and our organization is working to ensure the representation of Africa and make its voice heard.

What are our activities? We have to contribute to the public consultation. I ask all the AFRALO members to do the checking and to participate to the open public consultation for which ALAC is preparing some comments. Our objective is also to improve the African level of participation about the discussion on Internet governance.

Now today, we have reached the number of 30 ALSes. As you can see, since the creation of At-Large in 2003, we are growing. Here you can see in this map the deployment of these 30 ALSes. If you see in the brochure

that we gave you, there is a description of each ALS. If we want, we can summarize it in some words.

Okay, I'm sorry. Our ALS represents organization like NGO, ISOC chapters, or associations that represent the local users of the Internet and of the ICTs. Our actions are translated into training for young people, for [poor] people, development of [inaudible], etc.

Now we are only 20 countries of 50 countries of Africa represented into AFRALO. Cameroon is represented with more ALS with four ALS than Nigeria, Tunisia, RDC, Morocco. And the other countries are represented by only one ALS.

You have in front of you the data saying that we have three applications for accreditation. It's OFSON from Nigeria, ISOC Tchad, and ISOC Mauritius. Next one, please.

These ALS work and vote for their representative in their region. AFRALO is represented by three officers. We have a chairperson; a vice chairperson, Mohamed El Bashir with me here from ISOC Sudan; secretariat, Philip Johnson, ISOC Liberia.

We have representatives from AFRALO from ALAC: Tijani Ben Jemaa, Hadja Ouattara (she couldn't come here), and Beran Gillen. She's still here? Yes, she's still here. They were selected by NomCom.

Then we have Fatimata Seye Sylla. She's not here. She wasn't able to come. She's a representative of Africa for the NomCom.

When we speak about AFRALO activities, first there are the current activities as monthly teleconferences. I invite you please to participate

more to those teleconferences. We have seen new ALS joining each month and participate to those monthly teleconferences. On the first Wednesday of each month they take place. We invite you to participate to them.

We are publishing on the AFRALO wiki page the monthly reports. Philip is drafting those reports. In those reports, we describe the activities that we are organizing in AFRALO.

Then another important item, this is the reason why the RALO exists. It is because the AFRALO members have to participate to the open public consultations. For that, you have to see to check the ICANN website and you will see a list for which ICANN is asking for is consulting the people and they need our opinion as a region. This opinion is submitted to ALAC, and ALAC will prepare its comment.

We have also created an AFRALO Spotlight with the ICANN staff in which African ALSes publish their activities. So you can use it. Please use this Web page. It's important for your ALS so as to have traceability and some visibility at the local, regional, international level.

We have created a brochure. I'm not sure everyone got this brochure. It describes all the ALSes. Yesterday and the day before that, we were handing out these brochures. We no longer have any of these available, but I could give you mine if you want it.

That's a description of ALSes and their activities, etc., but I'm sure all this will be made available online with the help of staff. Heidi will be helping us do this. You could download that information. By the same means, of course, you could update the information on your ALS every

time there is a change needed. So that's very important to exchange information.

Here's a page. If you haven't seen it, it's important that you get acquainted with it. It is afralo.org. That's where you can find all the information on ALSes and activities belonging to AFRALO. You have here reports from March. Some are coming a bit late. We're lacking a bit. Some are still to come, but at least that gives you an idea.

If you don't participate in teleconferences, that helps you get an idea of the discussion underway. You can find recordings of our teleconferences if you couldn't attend. There is audio recordings of teleconferences, and there's even a transcription in PDF form and the statements that we submit to ALAC and to ICANN and ICANN's activities.

Furthermore in the following page, you have – one more. One behind. That. You have the Spotlight I was talking about here. Here's ISOC Liberia, which has an activity. This is information for the rest of ALSes. That gives your own structure a good level of visibility. You're, of course, welcome to use it.

One of the [beacon activities] of AFRALO since Mexico in 2009 – because I remind you our first general meeting took place in 2009 – is the Program of Virtual Capacity Building. We saw since our Mexico summit that there was a great need to have a better knowledge of the remit and the role of ICANN, of the way it works, of the subjects it deals with.

It was to that end that we got together with the help of the other RALOs – LACRALO, for instance, and EURALO. We got together and we brought 20 ALS representatives to Dakar from 17 different countries for six training sessions of two hours each. We had them wake up at 5:30 in the morning every day so that they could attend our meetings at 7:00 in the morning.

To be honest, it was very interesting. Those capacity building session in Dakar took place during all five days of the meeting. There were presentations on the mission, the activities, the structure of ICANN, but also on policy issues and on the [stakes] of the Internet.

Those sessions were led and delivered by ICANN staff and by different participants and gave way to very important discussions. The purpose of these capacity building sessions was to raise awareness among ALSes regarding ICANN’s processes but also to get them engaged.

That purpose, it can be said, was achieved because the effective engagement of our ALSes in AFRALO activities increased greatly –about 30%, which was highly encouraging.

After that local capacity building session, we had a survey that we asked ALSes to fill in so that those ALSes would give us their advice. That led to our organizing the virtual training sessions with the help of staff. We held three webinars. That was right before the Durban meeting.

Currently, we expect to increase the level of participation and the level of engagement at our ALSes so that we are much more efficient in order to follow up and contribute effectively to the open policy issues and open consultation processes.

There is, of course, a matter of language here involved. Of course, any time there's an important meeting or an important working group and if there is anyone asking for French to be translated – because that's mainly the language that's asked for as it is one of the main languages spoken in Africa – staff can make available for certain working groups the interpretation services or translation of documents.

Then as you know for AFRALO, we go on participating actively. Here's a list of the working groups. I have a list of participants in order to thank them for participating in those working groups. These are AFRALO participants. I would like to thank them all for giving their time in order to contribute and give Africa's voice and contribute with Africa's voice to those working groups.

Those different working groups, we have the Finance and Budget Subcommittee. There's Outreach Subcommittee. There is the Metrics Subcommittee that we dealt with yesterday. The Subcommittee on the Selection of Members for the Steering Committee. There's Certification and Decertification as well, which Tijani will be dealing with in a minute. Then there's the At-Large Capacity Building Working Group. Next, please.

The Working Group on Future Challenges, IDN Policy, New gTLDs Working Group, the Registration Issues Working Group, the Social Media Working Group. Next, please.

The Community Regional Outreach Pilot Program Review Team. It is a review team on CROPP. Fatimata will be presenting that if she is online. Is she online? Okay, she will be joining us shortly. Then there's an At-Large ICANN Academy Ad Hoc Working Group. Next, please.

The Working Group on the New gTLD Review Group Workspace, then At-Large Summit II Working Group (ATLAS II) working group. Various people who participated and organized that summit.

Then there's a Board Candidate Evaluation Committee (BCEC). This is a Board candidate evaluation committee, so they assess who would be a better candidate in order to become a member of the Board. As you know, Rinalia was appointed instead of Sébastien Bachollet.

I would like to congratulate Tijani who led the selection process committee for Board Members. That's the BMSPC for 2014. We're very proud of him. It was AFRALO, you see, that led this Board Member Selection Process Committee this year. They had to deal with ensuring that the selection process be transparent clear. I can tell you, it was not an easy task.

Then we have the At-Large Ad Hoc Working Group on the Transition of U.S. Government Stewardship of the IANA Function.

Some working groups are still working. Some have concluded their job. But if you want to participate, please, you're welcome to join.

To conclude, here are some actions we took throughout different ICANN meetings. This is specific to our regional RALO. We held 12 AFRALO/AfrICANN joint meetings. We have engaged within African community. As you know, those activities gather the entire African community so that we can discuss issues that are decided on beforehand in order to reflect the concerns of our communities.

At the end of each meeting, we submit a statement to the Board of ICANN from the African community. We must underline here the

wonderful job of our ALSes who are instrumental to the preparing of those meetings, of the subjects and issues that we would like to discuss, even in the drafting of those statements which have to be prepared before we get to ICANN meeting. I would like to thank and celebrate the participation of everyone who has taken part in that.

If you're interested, please, you're welcome to propose – to suggest – what issues you think are of interest as long as it is an issue that is addressed to the Board of ICANN, what the African community would like to ask of the ICANN Board.

We have, indeed, had remarks from our African colleagues in order to ask us that there be a sort of inventory or an assessment of such statements. That was done between Durban and Singapore. We prepared a chart that was a scorecard. In it, we summed up all of the statements that we submitted that were addressed to ICANN's Board.

Through that chart, we measured the impact of such African statements vis-à-vis the Board or the decisions that the Board has taken. If you have any questions on that, of course we could give you some more detail of what the statements were and of the statements which had no impact particularly.

Secondly, there was an MoU that we signed that was at the Durban meeting. We concluded an MoU (a Memorandum of Understanding) before AFRALO and AFRINIC. We're proud to say this and to remind everyone of this every time we get a chance. We were the first to sign such an MoU, and afterwards other regions followed our example.

We were the first to have a showcase at Nairobi as well. Now, it has become a tradition. Apparently, every time there's a meeting in a region, everyone wants to have a showcase. It's the local RALO that organizes a showcase.

"What's a showcase?" you might be wondering. Certainly, it is an evening where we invite the chair of ALAC who's here with us. He always gives a great address to everyone present, for Africa particularly, of course. We invite ICANN's CEO. We organize different shows from folkloric dance and music, bands from the region. Of course, we try to benefit the local community.

Every time we meet, we try to innovate. In Durban, our first ever was having local associations attend the meeting. That was about 20 youngsters who came from universities, schools, or organizations.

In fact, among those people was Mercy, who is here with us. That's how she discovered ICANN meetings. Thanks to that, she was appointed and she was selected for the mentorship program. I think it is a wonderful choice they've made. So far, Mercy has been very effective, very engaged. She has participated very effectively at our Singapore meeting and at this London meeting.

Like I said, the showcase in Dakar was a great success because we had prominent people there, such as the telecommunications minister from Senegal, for instance, and ICANN's CEO, of course.

I'm sorry. I'm not respecting my own [delays]. I've set these [delays] in the agenda, and I'm not respecting them myself. Ariel, can we...? There.

AFRALO – and this was a real struggle. For a long time, AFRALO struggled for ICANN to be present at the IGF (Internet Governance Forum) and that ICANN be represented through our RALO. Thanks to Tijani’s work, and he has to be recognized at that, we participated at two meetings.

In Baku, we organized a workshop with different speakers. Then in Bali in 2013, we organized a workshop on how the Internet could be an engine of growth and development in an event to reduce the digital gap. If you have questions, I’m ready to reply. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Didier, you have the floor.

DIDIER KASOLE:

I will speak French. I’m not sure it’s going to be a question. It might be a remark. But I want to go back to what Pierre said a while ago – Pierre Dandjinou, vice president for the African strategy – about his report.

If I’m not mistaken, he said we had to encourage consumers not to be spectators, to be active. If that’s what he said and I’m not mistaken, I support him 100%.

It would be good for our upcoming activities to add that as an activity – as one of the main activities – to encourage users or consumers to become actors, to be players, to seize this technology which is so wonderful and which gives anyone the possibility of being a player, of not only being a consumer. If we take part in the actions of

development of this technology, of course, we will better seize this technology and its uses.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Didier. First, Oliver, and then Oliver. We have two Oliviers. Okay, Olivier first.

OLIVIER [INAUDIBLE]:

Thank you ever so much, Mr. Chair. I would first want to thank ICANN for having allowed me to come back because I've been in this process before. I stopped participating for a number of years because I wanted the following ICANN meetings not to be the same as the first. I will explain this.

I witnessed the marvelous work that you do, but I see that there is something missing. You're missing a link in your chain. How can you convince people in the decision making process by giving them fact-based data?

We speak of users. I see, thanks to my studies in the field for almost six years now, that African users allocate 12% of their revenues to activities related to Internet consumption. That's a percentage of 1.9% in Britain. How can we prevent our Internet from becoming an impoverishment tool for the masses?

In my country, for instance, we have a greater percentage of resources assigned to this than in Morocco. I think there's a lot to be done around this process, and maybe we should further develop and understand why with all that we do Internet in all 17 African countries, that I studied at

least, are not over 3%. There are questions to be asked here. There's work to be done.

I suggest that we include in this marvelous work that we do a streamlining of the studies of the real status of the market and of the users at a given point in time and that when we meet, when we reconvene, we're not simply wishing but that we're able to say, "Well, this is the current status. This is the strategy we're going to implement as a consequence."

That's my contribution, Mr. Vice President, as regards that report.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you. Pierre wants to leave, so can we allow him a minute to give us a closing remark? Then you can have the floor.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Yes, I'm sorry. I'm already five minutes late for another meeting. Having heard the list of activities, maybe we could also try to also be much more innovative and have impact on the ground.

For instance, one of the things I'm seeing is that: how are we doing with the multi-stakeholderism at the country level? We are having ministers that now are coming to our meetings. One of them was telling me, "Well, I never heard about those things." The only one thing that maybe he heard about was that his ccTLD was not well managed.

My point here is that what you are going to see in terms of development of Internet governance is that: country level, how are we building the multi-stakeholderism? I would like to challenge ALSes to be

part of this. I know that's going to be part of how our chapters and our other chapters. By the way, I'm founder of one of the chapters in Africa. But I think that is important.

And second thing, and Olivier just touched upon this one: how are we contributing to the local data? We need data. We are planning an observatory for ccTLDs in Africa. We don't have those information. There is no special way that you get to know that figures from Africa. I think there can be some contribution from you guys. It's quite important.

Nobody can tell me exactly today how many registrants we do have in Africa. Where do you get that information? Yet, we are talking about business planning in Africa. We are talking about discussing with decision makers, regulators so that they [eventually] contribute to this. But you need to demonstrate your case. We don't have figures.

Maybe these are some of the things that we need to consider. Okay, thanks.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Pierre. We've only just got time for Tijani to take the floor, Mohamed, Philip. Please, state your name before speaking and take a maximum of two minutes, because if you don't, I'm going to stop you right there.

CHIMA ONYEKWERE:

I will take less than two minutes. Thank you. I am on the Board of NiRA. Like I said earlier, NiRA is Nigerian Internet Registration Association. I

actually share the communication of [inaudible]. I also work for DigitalSENSE Africa.

Well, very quick one. Just in line with, it seems [Aziz] was picking in mind. I was also trying to point out I didn't see country overview or report on what you presented to us. I was looking towards getting that, even if it means a one-minute report from each country in Africa to get encapsulated in that report. That would give also an idea whether we're making progress or not.

Let me not also forget the role ISOC is playing in driving this process because most of the countries where ALAC has a presence, ISOC has been very active. I must confess to you even in Nigeria as well that a lot has to be done still.

It is also important that we include at least even if it is one-minute process to re-explain how we can engage at every meeting. It is necessary to [inaudible] those who are also present at the meeting and those who are [inaudible] us remotely to know this is possible instead of just referring people to the site. Referring people to the site is good, but sometimes not everyone will have the time to go to the site after all. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you. After Olivier, we have [Syed].

[SYED] [INAUDIBLE]:

[Syed] [inaudible], FCC Comores. I'm very impressed by what you made. But what made the responsible at the regional level, my question is to

them. Do you feel that what you are doing today at the ICANN level has some coherence? Do you feel enough support? Because we need some people upstairs, but also downstairs. We need some people from Africa.

In a session, we said that we needed some inventory. We need to have some realities in our regions. We can see that today Internet is not only for intellectual people. Internet is also in other country, in the villages in Africa.

In East Africa, we have the financial inclusion today. What do we do with this money? How do we do it? It can be a case study about security, about inclusion. We can do some studies in the universities how we do, how we build synergies without asking ICANN to do everything. How we work, basing this on what we have, on what exists.

Now what I like to say is because I'm asking is there some coherence, I think we need to articulate a strategy at the continent level.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. Alan, you have the floor.

ALAN LEVIN: Thank you, Aziz. Thank you, Tijani, for your presentation on the activities of the AFRALO. I see that there's been a great deal of work around the organization of the AFRALO and even some attempts at outreach.

I have one question that relates to the work of the AFRALO and that is I don't seem to see any participation or submissions into the policymaking with respect to the technical coordination of the Internet.

My understanding is that ICANN's role is a technical coordination role, specifically with regards to the DNS and the numbering of the Internet. I'm not aware of any AFRALO submissions or participation in the actual activities of ICANN. That's really what I'm here for.

In respect to that, I'd like to just answer. We certainly do research on the activities of Africans on the technical level. I was just looking at the ISC domain survey. That's the Internet Software Coalition who do a survey of use of the different ccTLDs.

Maybe I can point out that in July 2013, the most recent results available, Benin as an example have 784 entries using their ccTLD compared to .za which is about 3.5 million. There's a great disparity there. Unfortunately, there are more than a dozen African domains with under 3,000 entries in the domain name system.

My question is, really, what is our purpose if we're not participating or actively increasing use of the DNS and the numbering system in various countries?

What I don't have information on is the numbering local Internet registries. I'd like to suggest that AFRINIC as one of our partner organizations and the organization which our esteemed colleague Dandjinou was one of the founders, I suggest as AFRALO we make a request to AFRINIC to produce an annual survey.

It's quite simple. They have access to the full database of LIRs. It need not be personal. We can protect the privacy of all LIRs, but just to publish an annual survey of which countries, LIRs, what allocations have been made to which countries.

I think together with the ISC survey, that's going to give us all the statistics that we really need to understand with regards to Africa. What we need to. I mean, we want to understand a whole lot more, but we really need to understand how the ccTLDs. That's one area. And I'd love to understand how numbering is used in Africa. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Alan. Yes, I agree with you about what you said about the technical part of AFRALO. In my presentation, I wanted to ask people like you, like you Alan, you are among the AFRALO from later. You are able to work in that issue in our group. We have a [enabled] you with AFRINIC to work about this issue. It is very important for the African region, so I thank you.

Now, we have leave that room in 15 minutes, so now we have time to give the floor to persons who have prepared their presentation. Okay. You have established a rule to take the floor. I like that rule to be observed, to be obeyed. I was going to do an intervention of one minute, and it's not the case of everybody here.

Thank you. You're right. Ask you, please, can I shut the microphone of a person who is speaking for more than one minute and a half. Who is asking for the floor, please? Okay, [inaudible], you have the floor. [inaudible], you have the floor.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Okay, you asked us to do a multi-stakeholder approach. We speak about data and availability of data. We have a problem of awareness and multi-stakeholder awareness. What do we do for the FSI, for the

regulators, governments, administrations? All that is the multi-stakeholder. We need to do a work with those multi-stakeholders.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. We are going to give the floor to Olivier Crépin-Leblond.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I just wanted to add to Alan Levin's suggestion, which was to actually coordinate the lists. Earlier this week or during the weekend, there was a meeting of the ccNSO leadership with the ALAC leadership.

There was a request which was made of the ccTLD operator lists and the At-Large RALO ALS list to be put onto one table so that we could find out, on a per country code, find out what At-Large Structures there are along with some details so as to be able to facilitate communication and enhanced cooperation between the local country code and the local At-Large Structures.

You have mentioned extending this to numbers, and that certainly is also a very good idea. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Olivier. Now we are going to give the floor to [inaudible].

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] South Africa, Nigeria. I just want to say that no one mentioned of IPv6 transition. [Does it mean that simply] because we have a number of IPv4 addresses in Africa or we have to remember why

others are moving up. Besides, I think we should do more in terms of awareness creation, because if we say all the things we say here and our people don't make use of the Internet or the domain names, per se, we're not making any sense. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you for your comment. Now we have no time to answer to your comment. We are going to give the floor to Tijani. Tijani's going to speak about an item that is very important. Maybe, Heidi, can we please have 15 minutes more, please? Okay, Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you. I'm going to speak about the review of the AFRALO operating principles. As you know, ALAC has made a review of its operating principles. Since we established our principles, we didn't review any of them. It's important to do it now because we have to check them. It's an issue that is discussed in all ALAC, so we have to do it too and we have to speak about that.

A review of the AFRALO operating principles taking into account these items. First, the individual membership, North Africa and North America, has established this principle and they have individual members in their RALO. Europe has adopted this system last year, and other RALOs are going to do it. I think LACRALO adopted it too.

Now I think we need to adopt it, as the world is asking for an individual participation to the RALO. It can also be an individual. It's not only association. We can find people working very well, helping us and contributing but people that doesn't belong to any association.

The second item, this item we have spoken about that two years ago, and there was a refusal in our RALO. I think we have to analyze it again in another way. The second item, we are seeing that some countries in Africa have more ALS than other countries.

In Latin America, this situation also exists. In Argentina, we have a lot of ALS, and they decided that the vote should be made by country and not by ALS because they say that in that case a country can have all the votes in the RALO. So they decided that they were going to vote country-by-country.

We also have discussed this issue two years ago, and it was rejected by our RALOs. Now we have more and more ALS in some countries, so we have to think about that issue.

Third item, very important for the review of the operating principles, it is the participation criteria and the performance criteria. For ALAC, after the reviewing of the operating principles, we have analyzed the criteria for participation and performance in ALAC. Now we are almost finished.

But this we also said in this working group that the RALOs need to have their own criteria. It is a decision of the RALO, so we are not going to do one-size-fits-all. We are not going to apply this kind of system. Each region is going to have its own cultural features, regional features, and so they can use their own criteria.

This is also important. We have to decide about the criteria for participation of the ALS because some ALS are not participating at all. They are not participating to the conference call once a month. To

participate in a conference call, it's a minimal. They don't participate to the conference call.

Each month we give the list of the policy development of the policy that we are discussing for which we need the opinion of our region, and we insist asking them, "Please give. We need your opinion." And we have no participation at all.

This is also a criteria of performance and participation. There are other criteria, but what I mean is that in the future we need to make sure the participation and performance or RALOs. As we are going to do and we are doing, we are preparing these participation criteria of the ALAC member, we need to work on that.

The last item is the decertification. We have made the decertification of five or six ALS in the world, not in Africa. There were no African ALS proposed for decertification. But it was because we haven't checked the ALS who needed to be decertified. Because some of our ALS maybe don't exist anymore. People don't answer the phone or the mail, so some ALS can have disappeared.

With these criteria and with the studies that show the state of each ALS, we can see which ALS don't exist anymore and we can decertify them. This has been made in other regions, but we didn't make it in Africa because we didn't study that issue.

Those are the items that we need to include in the revision of the operating principles of our RALO. Thank you, Aziz.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tijani. We are not going to speak about all these issues here, but we have a lot of problems on that. This is an important item, and we have some countries with a lot of ALS, the decertification. We need to agree on criteria. What is an ALS active? What is an ALS not active? It is very important.

Now I'm going to give the floor to Fatimata. Fatimata, are you here with us? No, she's not here, but she's going to come. Okay, I'm giving the floor to Mohamed El Bashir who is going to speak about the challenges for AFRALO. I'm a little lost. Mohamed is asking for the floor. Okay, Mohamed El Bashir is going to speak about the challenges for AFRALO: how to improve the participation of ALSes within AFRALO. You have the floor. You have two minutes, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you, Chair. I think in a nutshell, we're facing the same issue that other RALOs are facing in terms of active participation of members.

We have about 28 ALSes currently in Africa, but if you look to the active participants, there are very few number of people within the ALSes and very few ALSes are actively participating. Issues raised earlier about translation and also availability of translated information, that was some of the issues that has been mentioned earlier.

With this few number of active participants, we've also managed to do some good work. We produced 11 statements. We have the AFRALO/AfrICANN meeting as well. That's annual, and we have a statement coming out of that. I think we were the first RALO to put this

draft statement regarding IANA transition. Also, we are the first RALO to put the statement regarding the NETmundial.

Translation definitely is an issue, but I think we urge you please to be more active. Because we tried before to have minimum participation criteria. We tried before to say an ALS minimum to do this: to participate in the monthly teleconference, to respond to a minimum number of consultations. But we find that as well challenging.

With the new bylaws modification in terms of setting – that might encourage us to raise the bar because as well we need active members to be available.

I think since I'm cautious regarding time, maybe the suggestion could be to ICANN if we can pull from the website the translated documents. Now if you go to the ICANN website, you can find French, Arabic, and other languages. If you click on the links, you find just one page. No links with the document there. So maybe if we can put translated document, it might help end users to understand the issues and maybe respond. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Mohamed. I've asked Philip to retire his intervention. So we have just time to give the floor to Fatimata. Fatimata is not here so, [inaudible], you have the floor.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you. I will speak for two minutes. Not more than that. First of all, I think that it's very important at that point of time that AFRALO look at

how to redesign their communication strategy based on the digital engagement project of ICANN. That is a big one. In fact, for ICANN to make their digital engagement project a success, they have to rely on AFRALO.

It means how are you going to reach people in area that people cannot use existing devices? I just want to give you a very simple example. In our African continent, if you think that people are going to use the Internet to get access to the information, you're kidding for two main reasons.

The first one is the network of telco operators is not well designed to handle video traffic and all this stuff. They handle voice call; that's it.

The price cost is the second barrier for their connection. Broadband costs in Africa represent more than 70% of the GDP for habitant. It means if you think that people are going to use the Internet to get access to what you're doing, we're kidding.

You need to think and to rethink and revamp and reshape your comms plan to reach people whom you're supposed to represent. This cannot be done if you don't use traditional media as the main stream that you're going to use to get your message out.

I'm inviting AFRALO to work closely with the comms plan – the comms department of ICANN – to see how you can use a new area of communication that represents more than 80% of the population.

We've got 1.4 billion TV stations available worldwide. It is the first media that people are using to get information. Look at the football games, you will understand.

I'm inviting you to take into account the media – TV and radio – as the main stream that you're going to use to get your information out of this room. Thank you.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Hello.

AZIZ HILALI: Fatimata, you have the floor.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you, Aziz. Two minutes. I just want to speak about the CROPP (Community Regional Pilot Project). To have more African people engaged in ICANN activities, last year you had access to five trips for the events linked to ICANN and the Internet governance in an African country. A member of the AFRALO can ask to go there and participate with the ICANN help to present the ICANN activities and to recruit ALS and people in the region.

We didn't have much trips this year because the year was very short, but we had two trips. Next year, we are going to have some more flexibility because there were some problems but we made the amendments necessary. We need to thank ICANN because the observation we made were taken into account. For example, the requester couldn't...

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, we have lost Fatimata. Okay. I thank everybody. Thank you. I hope we see you again next time. Okay, the general assembly of AFRALO is closed.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]